Enhancing National AI Policy: An inclusive approach for Pakistan's Defence Manufacturing Sector

Zahid Latif[1]

Mr. Jehanzeb Khan Orakzai[2]

Citation:
Latif, Z. (2023). Enhancing national AI policy: An inclusive approach for Pakistan's defence manufacturing sector. Khyber Journal of Public Policy, 3(1), Winter.

Article Info:
Received: 18/09/2023
Revised: 24/10/2023
Accepted: 2/11/2023
Published: 31/12/2023

Abstract:

Artificial Intelligence (AI) is reshaping various sectors, including healthcare, finance, logistics, and education, by enhancing data analysis and decision-making capabilities. Its transformative potential has prompted global recognition and policy development to harness its benefits. In the defense manufacturing sector, AI applications promise advancements in weapon systems, military robotics, logistics, and command and control, offering increased precision, efficiency, and reduced risks. This paper critiques Pakistan's National AI Policy draft, advocating for its extension to include defense manufacturing. By addressing policy gaps and integrating global best practices, the paper aims to ensure that Pakistan's AI strategy fosters innovation while enhancing national security. Effective policy revisions will bolster Pakistan's defense capabilities and position it strategically in the international AI landscape.

Key words:

Artificial Intelligence, Defense Manufacturing, National AI Policy, Policy Gaps, Technological Advancement

[1] *Currently posted as Manager-AAFI, Pakistan Ordinance Factories Board (POFB), Wah Cantt*

[2] *Faculty Advisor*

Introduction

Artificial intelligence (AI) has been a groundbreaking technology that has had far-reaching effects on society. It spans across the areas of healthcare, banking, logistics, and education (OECD, 2019). AI's ability to analyze large data sets, draw conclusions, and make sound decisions could spark a revolutionary change in how we live and work. The revolutionary capacity of AI is what has made countries around the globe recognize its importance and the different policies they have developed to ensure its effectiveness. AI's extraordinary ability to analyze vast amounts of information, comprehend it, and reach intelligent conclusions can transform how we live and work. This transformational ability has, in recent years, persuaded states worldwide to develop AI-oriented policies aimed at unleashing the full potential of the technology (Floridi, 2019).

One dominant theme revolves around having effective and far-sighted laws that encompass various dimensions, ranging from civil to military use cases and aspects of security concerns. This reveals that AI could be used for either peaceful or destructive purposes; therefore, policymakers must strike a delicate balance between promoting innovations and ensuring responsible applications in sensitive fields (Davenport & Harris, 2017). The defense manufacturing industry plays the most important role in this complex political situation. These functions include conducting research, developing sophisticated weapons, and modern communications gear. The country's self-reliance and security have always been closely associated with the capability of the defense industrial sector. This will lead to a new era, where military operations will be conducted using more precise systems, autonomous machines, and improved efficiencies based on AI (Arulkumaran et al., 2017).

AI's application in the defense manufacturing sector is multifaceted, and its potential benefits are far-reaching. In many ways, the use of AI-driven technologies is relevant for defense manufacturing:

Weapon Systems: AI may help make weapons more targeted, guided, and precise, thereby increasing their effectiveness and reducing the incidence of civilian casualties.

Military Robotics: Robots and unmanned vehicles using machine intelligence will further improve reconnaissance, surveillance, and fighting while reducing risks for soldiers.

Logistics and Supply Chain: AI can enhance logistics by meeting the needs for specific supplies and minimizing operational risks in military

detachments.

Command and Control: Military leaders may use AI to support their situational awareness and enable quick and intelligent reactions within a high-risk environment.

The integration of AI into the defense manufacturing sector is not confined to Pakistan; it is a global trend. Nations worldwide are channeling significant investments into AI research and development to maintain a technological edge in national defense. Therefore, it is imperative for Pakistan to adopt a holistic perspective and consider the defense manufacturing sector as an integral component of its AI policy framework (Ministry of Information Technology & Telecommunication Pakistan, 2023).

This policy paper seeks to address this necessity by critically examining Pakistan's National AI Policy draft and advocating for its expansion to include the defense manufacturing sector. By doing so, Pakistan can ensure that its AI policy is all-encompassing, seamlessly integrating both civilian and defense applications. This inclusive approach not only fosters innovation and growth but also fortifies national security and defense capabilities, aligning Pakistan with global advancements in AI technology. Additionally, this policy paper will delve into responsible and ethical considerations in AI use for defense, drawing from international best practices and case studies to provide a comprehensive roadmap for policymakers and stakeholders as they navigate the evolving landscape of AI within the defense context (Nazeer & Gil, 2023).

Problem Statement

Pakistan's Ministry of Information Technology & Telecommunication (MoITT) floated a consultative draft of the country's first National Artificial Intelligence Policy in May 2023. Like other emerging technologies, Artificial Intelligence (AI) is a dual-use technology with wider applications in the military domain, ranging from its integration with existing weapon systems to the development of a new generation of complex military robots. AI will revolutionize warfare by making it faster, smarter, and more autonomous. Considering the ever-growing spectrum of its applications, there is a need to critically analyze the AI policy draft with a view to making it comprehensive and inclusive of the defense manufacturing sector in Pakistan.

Literature Review

Introduction

Artificial Intelligence (AI) has emerged as a groundbreaking technology with profound implications across various sectors of society. In this document review, we delve into the multifaceted landscape of AI, assessing its contemporary significance and relevance. We will explore its evolution over time, core technologies and methodologies, influence across industries, ethical and regulatory considerations, challenges, prominent contributors and initiatives, current adoption patterns, and prospects for its future. This comprehensive examination will provide essential insights into AI's role in shaping the present and future of our world (Sumra Kalsoom B. & Alam, 2022).

The Evolution of AI Over Time

This section narrates the story of how AI has evolved from its inception to its current state. We will review the critical milestones and accomplishments in the history of AI research, placing them in their historical context as a backdrop for the revolutionary transformations attributed to AI (Bokhari & Myeong, 2023).

Core Technologies and Methodologies in AI

This section explores foundational technologies and methodologies behind AI, such as machine learning, neural networks, natural language processing, and computer vision. Understanding these basic aspects allows us to grasp how artificial intelligence will be applied in real life and why it is so crucial.

AI's Influence Across Industries

AI is having a broad impact on nearly every facet of life, including health, finance, production, and transportation. Therefore, we will provide specific instances where AI is applied in these industries, demonstrating its practical applications (Ajmal et al., 2021).

Ethical and Regulatory Dimensions of AI

Ethical concerns about artificial intelligence often revolve around bias, data breaches, and job displacement. This section addresses these concerns and discusses the imperative for establishing regulatory frameworks and ethical guidelines to govern AI development and deployment, ensuring responsible use (Kanwal et al., 2022).

Overcoming Challenges and Recognizing Limitations

While AI offers immense potential, it also comes with obstacles and constraints, such as data quality, interpretability, and security. Ongoing research and initiatives aimed at overcoming these challenges are explored, offering a balanced perspective on AI's capabilities and limitations.

Prominent Contributors and Initiatives in AI

The AI landscape is characterized by leading research institutions, organizations, and enterprises. This section highlights these prominent contributors and recent advancements and breakthroughs emerging from AI research endeavors, showcasing the dynamic nature of the field.

Current Patterns in AI Adoption

Data-driven insights and prevailing trends concerning the integration of AI by businesses and governmental entities are presented here. An analysis of the driving forces behind the growing adoption of AI provides a current snapshot of AI's impact on various sectors.

Prospecting the Future of AI

Speculating on the future of AI is essential to understand its transformative potential. This section envisions potential advancements, applications, and challenges, contemplating the role of AI in shaping society and the global economy. It provides a forward-looking perspective on the continued evolution of AI and its impact on our world (Dwivedi et al., 2021).

Policy Gap Analysis

In conducting a comprehensive analysis of the National Artificial Intelligence (AI) Policy in the context of the defense manufacturing sector, several crucial aspects merit detailed exploration to identify potential gaps and areas for improvement.

Current State of AI Integration in Defense Manufacturing in Pakistan

To gain a nuanced understanding of the AI landscape within the defense manufacturing sector, a detailed examination of the current state of research, development, and application in Pakistan is imperative. This involves assessing the level of awareness and expertise within the defense manufacturing industry regarding AI technologies. By delving into these specifics, we can uncover existing strengths and pinpoint areas that require targeted attention in the policy framework.

Review of the National AI Policy Framework

Scrutinizing the National AI Policy with respect to our defense sector capabilities is a critical step to determine its suitability for addressing the unique challenges and opportunities within the defense manufacturing sector. This involves a thorough analysis of the policy's scope, objectives, and emphasis, focusing on understanding its alignment with the distinctive requirements of defense manufacturing applications. This assessment of coverage and relevance will inform subsequent recommendations for policy refinement.

Comparison with International Best Practices

Benchmarking the National AI Policy against international best practices is essential for drawing insights from successful strategies employed by countries with advanced AI capabilities in defense manufacturing. Analyzing relevant case studies provides a contextual understanding of effective approaches and potential adaptations that can enhance the policy's effectiveness within the Pakistani context.

Financial Support

The National AI Policy draft lacks emphasis on incorporating AI in defense manufacturing. To maintain deterrence, it is imperative that Pakistan increase its budget and invest more in enhancing the lethality of weapons, underwater defense systems, and air force stealth technology.

Legal and Regulatory Landscape

An examination of the legal and regulatory frameworks governing AI applications in defense manufacturing is vital. Revised regulations will shed light on potential obstacles that may hinder the responsible and ethical deployment of AI technologies. Addressing this aspect is essential for ensuring compliance, ethical use, and legal clarity within the defense manufacturing sector.

Technical Infrastructure and Readiness

Assessing the technical readiness for AI integration in defense manufacturing involves evaluating the existing infrastructure, data capabilities, and interoperability within the sector. Identifying technical constraints that may impede successful implementation is crucial for tailoring the policy to address specific technological needs and ensuring a seamless integration of AI technologies.

Economic Implications

An in-depth assessment of the economic implications of the National AI Policy on the defense manufacturing sector is necessary. This includes evaluating investment incentives, funding mechanisms, and economic sustainability within the sector. Identifying gaps in these economic considerations will inform strategies to bolster growth and competitiveness in the evolving landscape of AI-driven defense technologies.

Educational and Skill Development Programs

Investigating the educational and skill development initiatives outlined in the National AI Policy, specifically tailored for the defense manufacturing workforce, is essential. Focusing on deficiencies in these programs ensures that the sector has the requisite human capital equipped to harness AI technologies effectively, fostering innovation and competitiveness.

Ethical and Social Considerations

Scrutinizing the ethical considerations addressed in the National AI Policy, particularly within the context of defense manufacturing, is crucial. Addressing the ethical and social implications ensures the responsible and ethical use of AI technologies in defense applications, addressing concerns related to bias, privacy, and societal impact.

Implementation Perspective

Developing an Actionable Implementation Plan

Formulating an actionable implementation plan involves creating a detailed roadmap for adjusting and expanding the National AI Policy to address identified gaps. This includes specifying timelines, responsible entities, and estimated budget requirements for each proposed recommendation, ensuring practical and feasible steps toward policy enhancement.

Establishing Key Performance Indicators (KPIs)

Defining measurable KPIs is essential for assessing the success and impact of the policy adjustments. These indicators provide a quantifiable means to gauge progress and ensure that the objectives are met effectively, contributing to the overall success of the policy.

Monitoring and Adaptation Mechanisms

Constructing a Comprehensive Monitoring and Evaluation Framework

Developing a robust framework for monitoring and evaluating the progress of policy implementation involves establishing systematic assessment criteria. This encompasses regular evaluations of AI integration in defense manufacturing, allowing for ongoing adjustments and refinements based on real-time insights and evolving needs.

Specifying Periodic Review and Adjustment Mechanisms

Outlining mechanisms for periodic reviews ensures the adaptability of the AI policy to evolving trends and technological advancements in defense manufacturing and AI applications. This proactive approach enables timely adjustments, maintaining the policy's relevance and effectiveness in the dynamic landscape of AI technologies.

Analytical Techniques Employed

SWOT Analysis

The SWOT analysis for Pakistan's draft National Artificial Intelligence Policy reveals a multifaceted landscape. The policy's strengths lie in its strategic importance, symbolizing the country's acknowledgment of the transformative potential of AI. The interdisciplinary collaboration implied by the policy could foster a holistic approach. Furthermore, the policy opens doors for innovation and technological advancements, positioning Pakistan competitively on the global stage. However, weaknesses such as a potential lack of expertise and resource constraints may pose challenges to effective implementation. Regulatory hurdles and resistance from traditional defense manufacturing practices add to the complexity. On the flip side, the policy presents opportunities for defense modernization, international collaboration, economic growth, and research and development. Yet, security concerns and ethical dilemmas, coupled with global competition and geopolitical dynamics, stand as formidable threats. A nuanced approach that leverages strengths, mitigates weaknesses, capitalizes on opportunities, and addresses threats is crucial for formulating a robust and inclusive National Artificial Intelligence Policy in Pakistan, especially in the context of defense manufacturing.

Strengths:

- **Strategic Importance:** The development of a National Artificial Intelligence Policy reflects Pakistan's recognition of the strategic importance of AI.

- **Interdisciplinary Collaboration:** If the policy involves collaboration across different government departments, it could lead to a holistic approach.
- **Potential for Innovation:** AI integration in defense manufacturing could foster innovation and technological advancements in the sector.
- **Global Competitiveness:** Implementing a robust AI policy could enhance Pakistan's global competitiveness in the rapidly evolving field of AI.

Weaknesses:

- **Lack of Expertise:** The country may face a shortage of AI experts and professionals, impacting the effective implementation of the policy.
- **Resource Constraints:** Limited financial and technological resources may hinder the development and execution of AI initiatives, especially in the defense sector.
- **Regulatory Challenges:** Developing regulations for the dual-use nature of AI may pose challenges, especially in aligning with existing legal frameworks.
- **Potential Resistance:** There might be resistance from traditional defense manufacturing processes or stakeholders not fully embracing AI technologies.

Opportunities:

- **Defense Modernization:** AI integration can lead to the modernization of defense capabilities, including the development of advanced military technologies.
- **International Collaboration:** Opportunities for collaboration with other countries and international organizations on AI development and defense applications.
- **Economic Growth:** A thriving AI sector in defense could contribute to economic growth and job creation in Pakistan.
- **Research and Development:** The policy can encourage investment in AI research and development, fostering a culture of innovation in defense manufacturing.

Threats:

- **Security Concerns:** The militarization of AI raises security concerns, and the policy must address potential risks and vulnerabilities.
- **Ethical Dilemmas:** The autonomous nature of AI in military applications may pose ethical dilemmas, requiring careful consideration and guidelines.
- **Global Competition:** Intense global competition in AI and defense technologies may pose a threat if Pakistan falls behind in innovation.

- **Geopolitical Dynamics:** Political tensions and international relations could impact collaboration and technology transfer in the field of AI.

Issues/Challenges/Analysis

In the pursuit of enhancing the National AI Policy to encompass the defense manufacturing sector in Pakistan, a meticulous analysis of various critical aspects is imperative. This comprehensive examination will delve into specific details relevant to the defense industry, considering the unique challenges and opportunities associated with the integration of artificial intelligence (AI) technologies.

Industry Pioneers

In scrutinizing the involvement of established industry pioneers within the defense manufacturing sector, a focus will be placed on understanding their current technological capabilities, ongoing AI initiatives, and strategic roadmaps. Insights from industry leaders will provide a nuanced perspective on the challenges they face in adopting AI, ranging from technological barriers to market dynamics. This analysis will inform policy recommendations that not only address industry challenges but also leverage the sector's expertise for collaborative innovation.

Startups and Centers of Innovation

An in-depth analysis of startups and innovation centers within the AI domain, with a specific emphasis on their relevance to defense manufacturing, will be conducted. This includes evaluating their technological innovations, existing collaborations, and potential contributions to the defense sector. Policymakers will explore avenues for fostering partnerships and creating an enabling environment for startups to thrive, ensuring a diverse and dynamic ecosystem.

Government Initiatives

The examination of government initiatives will extend beyond a cursory review to an in-depth assessment of their impact on defense manufacturing. This involves analyzing the alignment of existing policies with the specific needs of the defense industry, evaluating the effectiveness of financial incentives, and identifying areas for targeted support. The goal is to refine and enhance existing initiatives to better facilitate AI integration within the defense manufacturing sector.

Ethical and Regulatory Considerations

Given the sensitive nature of defense applications, ethical and regulatory considerations will be scrutinized in detail. This involves a thorough analysis of the ethical implications of AI technologies in defense manufacturing, along with an assessment of the existing regulatory frameworks. Policymakers will explore ways to strike a balance between innovation and ethical standards, ensuring responsible AI deployment within the defense sector.

AI Applications in Defense Manufacturing

A granular analysis of AI applications within the defense manufacturing sector will be conducted. This involves a detailed examination of use cases such as autonomous weapon systems, predictive maintenance, and AI-driven logistics. Policymakers will identify specific challenges and opportunities associated with each application, guiding the development of policies tailored to the sector's unique requirements.

International Collaboration

The analysis of opportunities for international collaboration will be refined to specifically address defense-related AI initiatives. Policymakers will explore successful collaborations between Pakistan and other nations in defense manufacturing, considering joint research, technology transfer, and collaborative projects. This analysis aims to identify strategic partnerships that enhance Pakistan's technological capabilities in defense AI applications.

Talent and Workforce Readiness

The analysis of talent and workforce considerations will extend beyond general skill assessments to a sector-specific evaluation. This involves identifying the specialized skills required for AI integration in defense manufacturing, assessing the readiness of the existing workforce, and developing strategies for upskilling. Policies will be tailored to nurture a skilled workforce capable of driving innovation in defense AI applications.

Through this detailed analysis of industry pioneers, startups, government initiatives, ethical and regulatory considerations, international collaboration, AI applications in defense manufacturing, and talent and workforce readiness, policymakers can derive nuanced insights. These insights will serve as the foundation for targeted amendments to the National AI Policy, ensuring its inclusivity and effectiveness in fostering the responsible integration of AI technologies within Pakistan’s defense manufacturing sector.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the examination of Pakistan's National AI Policy within the context of defense manufacturing highlights the urgent necessity of addressing policy gaps to unlock the full potential of artificial intelligence (AI) in the country's defense system. A nuanced analysis of various aspects, including international cooperation, AI applications, talent development, and more, provides crucial insights into the strategic imperatives essential for the integration of AI technologies into the military production industry. It is paramount for Pakistan to rectify the deficiencies in its AI policy, recognizing that defense manufacturing has evolved into a sophisticated environment demanding a cohesive AI policy framework.

The amalgamation of AI and defense technologies presents boundless opportunities for innovation, efficiency, and a competitive edge. Addressing specific policy gaps is crucial to adapting the regulatory environment to the complexities and nuances of AI applications in defense. An ideal AI policy framework holds the potential for substantial benefits in Pakistan's defense manufacturing sector, providing guidance to other nations on collaborative efforts to bolster technological advancements through strategic partnerships. Moreover, robust policy frameworks foster ethical usage, ensuring privacy, addressing biases, and enhancing security in AI applications. Such frameworks also stimulate innovation and encourage investments in developing a skilled workforce dedicated to improving defense AI capabilities. Therefore, this study emphasizes the need for decisive measures to close these policy loopholes, specifically tailored to the intricacies of Pakistan's defense landscape. Refining existing policy frameworks, establishing global partnerships with leading AI nations, and developing a skilled workforce aligned with upcoming AI-related needs in defense technologies are imperative steps. Closing the policy gaps necessitates strategic changes in regulatory frameworks, substantial investments in research and development, and active engagement with all relevant industry stakeholders.

While acknowledging the commendable initiative of the existing National AI Policy draft, the analysis indicates that further steps are required to ensure its adequacy for the defense manufacturing sector. Amendments should be made to accommodate the specific intricacies of AI applications in defense, provisions for international collaboration, and tailored workforce development strategies. In conclusion, a proactive and comprehensive approach to refining the National AI Policy will not only strengthen Pakistan's defense manufacturing capabilities but also position the nation as a significant player in the global landscape of AI-driven innovation. This journey toward a well-structured AI policy framework represents an

investment in national security, technological advancement, and sustainable growth tailored to the unique needs of Pakistan's defense system.

Recommendations

Addressing the identified gaps in Pakistan's National AI Policy for defense manufacturing requires a comprehensive set of actions. Prioritizing these recommendations based on their potential impact and feasibility will pave the way for a strategic and effective implementation plan.

Refinement of Existing Policy Framework

The first recommendation is to undertake a thorough revision of the current framework through an appraisal of the identified gaps in the national AI policy. Therefore, an ad-hoc working group, including AI experts, representatives from MoIT&T, and Defense agencies, will be required. This will enable the enhancement of policy clarity, alignment with the unique requirements of the defense manufacturing industry, and incorporation of regimes appropriate to the complexity of AI applications in security. The prospect is a policy plan with large-scale impact; however, while feasible, it may be challenging to implement due to frequent changes.

Establishment of International Collaborative Platforms

One of the most significant recommendations is to enhance engagements with global AI leaders by building sharing platforms that foster information sharing, research partnerships, and technology transfer. This process would entail the creation of a diplomatic committee at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs in collaboration with the Department of Defense and ICT specialists. It will be substantial because it will strengthen Pakistan’s technological power, stimulate creativity, and lead to greater achievements. Medium feasibility implies it is important for both diplomacy and resource use. Nevertheless, it is imperative to emphasize this suggestion to position Pakistan prominently on the international AI stage.

Investment in Research and Development Initiatives

A critical recommendation involves setting aside a budget to conduct research and development activities focused on defense manufacturing. This would require creating a dedicated committee under the Ministry of Finance and Planning, involving defense research institutions and private sector experts. The goal is to stimulate innovation, drive advancements in AI applications, and position Pakistan as a hub for cutting-edge defense technologies. With high feasibility and potential impact, this recommendation

is instrumental in ensuring that Pakistan remains at the forefront of technological advancements in defense.

Strategic Workforce Development Programs

Implementing specialized workforce development programs is essential to cultivating a skilled workforce capable of navigating AI applications in defense manufacturing. This recommendation includes launching educational partnerships and upskilling initiatives within the next six months, with continuous updates based on industry needs. Collaborating with educational institutions, industry associations, and the Ministry of Education is vital for program implementation. With high feasibility and impact, this recommendation addresses the critical aspect of developing a talent pool aligned with the evolving demands of AI-driven defense technologies.

Enhancement of Regulatory Clarity

Enhancing regulatory frameworks to provide clarity on ethical considerations, data privacy, and security in AI applications within defense manufacturing is a crucial recommendation. This involves forming a regulatory task force under the Ministry of Information Technology & Telecommunication, involving legal experts and industry representatives. The anticipated impact is the effective addressal of legal and ethical concerns, fostering responsible and accountable use of AI technologies. With medium feasibility, this recommendation is vital for ensuring a robust and ethical framework that governs AI applications in defense manufacturing.

Implementation Plan

Refinement of Existing Policy Framework

Initiating the review process within the next six months is critical, with the goal of finalizing amendments within one year. The responsible entities would include the established task force, with an estimated budget of $500,000. This budget would cover expert consultations, legal reviews, and stakeholder engagement, ensuring a comprehensive and well-informed refinement of the policy framework.

Establishment of International Collaborative Platforms

Beginning diplomatic engagements within the next three months and establishing collaborative platforms within two years is the proposed timeline. The responsible entities would be a diplomatic team led by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, with an estimated budget of $1 million. This budget would cover expenses related to international conferences,

collaborative projects, and diplomatic missions, fostering meaningful partnerships with global AI leaders.

Investment in Research and Development Initiatives

Allocating funds in the upcoming annual budget and commencing initiatives within the next year is the proposed timeline. The responsible entities would be a dedicated committee under the Ministry of Finance and Planning, with an estimated budget of $2 million. This budget would support the initiation of research projects, driving advancements in defense technologies through focused R&D initiatives.

Strategic Workforce Development Programs

Launching educational partnerships and upskilling programs within the next six months is the proposed timeline. The responsible entities would collaborate with educational institutions, industry associations, and the Ministry of Education. The estimated budget of $1.5 million would cover expenses related to educational partnerships, training programs, and skill development initiatives, ensuring a skilled workforce aligned with the demands of AI-driven defense technologies.

Enhancement of Regulatory Clarity

Initiating regulatory enhancements within the next three months and implementing continuous updates over a one-year period is the proposed timeline. The responsible entities would be a regulatory task force under the Ministry of Information Technology & Telecommunication, with an estimated budget of $800,000. This budget would cover expenses related to legal consultations, regulatory reviews, and public awareness campaigns, ensuring clear and ethical governance of AI applications in defense manufacturing.

Key Performance Indicators (KPIs)

In evaluating the success and impact of the recommended actions, a set of Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) will serve as crucial metrics. These indicators are designed to gauge progress, effectiveness, and stakeholder satisfaction, ensuring a comprehensive assessment of the initiatives undertaken.

Refinement of Existing Policy Framework

To measure the success of the refinement of the existing policy framework, the following KPIs will be employed:

- **Percentage Improvement in Policy Clarity**: This metric quantifies the enhancement in the clarity and comprehensiveness of the AI policy, providing a tangible measure of the refinement's impact.
- **Stakeholder Satisfaction with the Revised Policy**: Evaluating the satisfaction levels of stakeholders, including government agencies, industry representatives, and AI experts, ensures that the revised policy meets the diverse needs and expectations of key stakeholders.

Establishment of International Collaborative Platforms

The success of establishing international collaborative platforms will be assessed through the following KPIs:

- **Number of Signed International Collaborations**: The number of alliances formed with international leading AI firms demonstrates the success of cooperation agreements and enhances multilateral interaction.
- **Quantifiable Growth in Technological Capabilities**: This KPI focuses on tangible changes in Pakistan's defense technological capacities due to such collaborations.

Investment in Research and Development Initiatives

To evaluate the outcomes of the investment in research and development initiatives, the following KPIs will be considered:

- **Number of Successful Research Projects Initiated**: Measuring the accomplishments resulting from investments and quantifying the degree of innovative progress made in defense manufacturing.
- **Tangible Advancements Achieved in Defense Technologies**: This KPI captures the tangible outcomes achieved in response to R&D programs, reflecting their quantitative significance for defense technologies.

Strategic Workforce Development Programs

The success of strategic workforce development programs will be assessed through the following KPIs:

- **Percentage Increase in AI-Skilled Workforce**: Quantifying the percentage increase in the number of professionals with AI-related skills within the defense manufacturing workforce, indicating the success of educational partnerships and upskilling programs.
- **Industry Satisfaction with the Skilled Workforce**: Evaluating the satisfaction levels of the defense manufacturing industry with the skilled workforce, ensuring that the workforce aligns with industry needs and expectations.

Enhancement of Regulatory Clarity

To measure the impact of enhancing regulatory clarity, the following KPIs will be utilized:

- **Percentage Improvement in Regulatory Frameworks**: Quantifying the improvement in regulatory frameworks governing AI applications in defense manufacturing, ensuring that legal and ethical considerations are effectively addressed.
- **Public Awareness and Understanding of AI Regulations**: Assessing the level of public awareness and understanding of AI regulations, indicating the success of public awareness campaigns and ensuring transparent communication about the regulatory landscape.

References

1. Ajmal, M. M., Khan, M., & Shad, M. K. (2021). The global economic cost of the coronavirus pandemic: Current and future implications. *Public Administration and Policy, 24*(3), 290–305. https://doi.org/10.1108/PAP-10-2021-0054
2. Arulkumaran, K., Deisenroth, M. P., Brundage, M., & Bharath, A. A. (2017). A brief survey of deep reinforcement learning. *ArXiv Preprint ArXiv:1708.05866*. https://arxiv.org/abs/1708.05866
3. Bokhari, S. A. A., & Myeong, S. (2023). The influence of artificial intelligence on e-governance and cybersecurity in smart cities: A stakeholder's perspective. *IEEE Access, 11*, 69783–69797. https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2023.3293480
4. Davenport, T. H., & Harris, J. (2017). *Competing on analytics: Updated, with a new introduction: The new science of winning*. Harvard Business Press.
5. Dwivedi, Y. K., Hughes, L., Ismagilova, E., Aarts, G., Coombs, C., Crick, T., Duan, Y., Dwivedi, R., Edwards, J., Eirug, A., Galanos, V., Ilavarasan, P. V., Janssen, M., Jones, P., Kar, A. K., Kizgin, H., Kronemann, B., Lal, B., Lucini, B., … Williams, M. D. (2021). Artificial intelligence (AI): Multidisciplinary perspectives on emerging challenges, opportunities, and agenda for research, practice, and policy. *International Journal of Information Management, 57*, 101994. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijinfomgt.2019.08.002
6. Floridi, L. (2019). Soft ethics, the governance of the digital, and the General Data Protection Regulation. *Philosophy & Technology, 32*(2), 189–193.
7. Kanwal, S., Mehran, M. T., Hassan, M., Anwar, M., Naqvi, S. R., & Khoja, A. H. (2022). An integrated future approach for the energy security of Pakistan: Replacement of fossil fuels with syngas for a better environment and socio-economic development. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews, 156*, 111978. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2021.111978
8. Ministry of Information Technology & Telecommunication Pakistan. (2023). *National artificial intelligence policy draft*.
9. Nazeer, S., & Gil, Y. (2023). Embracing artificial intelligence challenges for public sector organizations in Pakistan. *Journal of Contemporary Studies, 12*(1), 35–52. https://jcs.ndu.edu.pk/site/article/view/244
10. OECD. (2019). *Artificial intelligence in society*. OECD Publishing.
11. Sumra, K., Alam, M., & R. A. (2022). Artificial intelligence for strengthening administrative and support services in the public sector amid COVID-19: Challenges and opportunities in Pakistan. In S. M. Aboul-Ella & Z. I. Hassanien (Eds.), *Advances in data science and intelligent data communication technologies for COVID-19: Innovative solutions against COVID-19* (pp. 153–172). Springer International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-77302-1_9